

Rice's Theorem is a general statement about the decidability of a language. Informally, if a language  $L$  asks a nontrivial question about languages, then  $L \notin \text{DEC}$ . Let's formalize this.

A property of languages (or an I/O property) is a set  $P \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\Sigma^*)$ .

Define the set

$$L_p = \{\langle M \rangle \mid L(M) \in P\}.$$

A property  $P$  is trivial if  $L_p = \emptyset$  or  $L_p$  is the set of all TMs.  $P$  is nontrivial if  $L_p$  contains at least one TM but not all of them (i.e. not trivial).

A property  $P$  is a property of the TM's language if for all TMs  $M_1$  and  $M_2$  for which  $L(M_1) = L(M_2)$ ,  $\langle M_1 \rangle \in L_p \iff \langle M_2 \rangle \in L_p$ .

Ex)  $P = \emptyset$  is trivial

$P = \mathcal{P}(\Sigma^*)$  is trivial

$P = \text{RE}$  is trivial ( $L_p$  contains all TMs)

$\overline{P}$  where  $P$  is trivial is trivial

$P = \{L \mid \exists \text{TM } M \text{ with } L(M) = L \text{ and } M \text{ has an even \# of states}\} = \text{RE}$   
is not a property of the TM's language

Obs) Any trivial property  $P$  has  $L_p \in \text{DEC}$ .

Q: Why?

You either always accept or always reject.

Thm) (Rice's Theorem) For any nontrivial property  $P$  that is a property of the TM's language,  $L_p$  is undecidable.

Pf) We give a reduction from  $A_{TM}$  to  $L_p$ .  
 Assume wlog that  $\emptyset \notin P$  (we get the same result from  $P$  if so).  
 Since  $P$  is non-trivial,  $\exists L \in P$  and  $\exists \langle N \rangle \in L_p : L(N) = L$ .

Now consider the TM  $D_{M,w}$ :

$D_{M,w} = \text{"On input } v, \dots \text{, "}$

- 1) Run  $M(w)$ .
- 2) If  $M(w)$  does not accept, reject
- 3) Run  $N(v)$  and accept if it does
- 4) Reject."

Clearly,  $L(D_{M,w}) = \begin{cases} \emptyset & M(w) \text{ does not accept} \\ L & M(w) \text{ accepts.} \end{cases}$

This yields  $\langle D_{M,w} \rangle \in L_p$  iff  $M(w)$  accepts. ( $\emptyset \notin P$ ).

Now assume  $L_p \in \text{DEC}$ . Then there is a decider  $R$  with  $L(R) = L_p$ .

Consider the TM  $D$ :

$D = \text{"On input } \langle M, w \rangle \text{, "}$

- 1) Run  $R(\langle D_{M,w} \rangle)$ .
- 2) Accept if  $R(\langle D_{M,w} \rangle)$  accepts and reject otherwise"

Clearly,  $L(D) = \{ \langle M, w \rangle \mid M(w) \text{ accepts} \} = A_{TM}$ , so  $D$  decides  $A_{TM}$ .

$\rightarrow \leftarrow$

$\therefore L_p$  is not decidable.

□

Ex)  $\text{ALL}_{TM} = \{ \langle M \rangle \mid L(M) = \Sigma^* \}$  is not decidable.

Not all TMs accept  $\Sigma^*$ , so this is a nontrivial property.

Moreover, if  $L(M_1) = L(M_2)$ : for TMs  $M_1, M_2$ , then  $\langle M_1 \rangle, \langle M_2 \rangle \in \text{ALL}_{TM}$

iff  $L(M_1) = L(M_2) = \Sigma^*$ , hence this is a property of the TMs' language.

By Rice's Theorem,  $\text{ALL}_{TM}$  is undecidable.